BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04867 7066

CONTEMPORARY ISSUES IN FEDERALISM: THE FUTURE OF THE FEDERATION

1999-2000

VOLUME I

Prof. Sujit Choudhry

Faculty of Law,
University of Toronto

Special thanks to Rebecca Case, Allyn Chudy and Carol Wilton for their assistance in the preparation of these materials.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
JAN - 3 2000
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CONTEMPORARY ISSUES IN FEDERALISM: THE FUTURE OF THE FEDERATION

1999-2000

VOLUME I

Prof. Sujit Choudhry

Faculty of Law,
University of Toronto

Special thanks to Rebecca Case, Allyn Chudy and Carol Wilton for their assistance in the preparation of these materials.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/contemporaryissu00chou

CONTEMPORARY ISSUES IN FEDERALISM:
THE FUTURE OF THE FEDERATION

1999—2000

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

I. NORMATIVE JUSTIFICATIONS FOR FEDERALISM

No readings

II. SOCIAL POLICY

A. The New Deal Cases

1. Cases

Reference re Employment and Social Insurance Act, [1936] S.C.R. 427 1

Reference re Employment and Social Insurance Act, [1937] A.C. 355 (P.C.). 16

2. Commentary

V. MacDonald, "The Canadian Constitution Seventy Years After" (1937) 15 Can. Bar Rev. 401 at 412-415 and 419-425. 18

F.R. Scott, "The Consequences of the Privy Council Decisions" (1937) 15 Can. Bar Rev. 485 at 492-493. 23

J. H. Thompson with A. Seager, *Canada 1922-1939: Decades of Discord* Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1985) at 261-66. 24

B. The Post War Welfare State

K. Banting, "The Past Speaks to the Future: Lessons from the Postwar Social Union" in H. Lazar, ed., *Non-Constitutional Renewal* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1998) 39 at 39-48 and 50-61 27

C. The Constitution and Social Policy

1. Federal Spending Power

(a) Cases

Porter v. Canada, [1965] 1 Ex. C.R. 200 37

Central Mortgage and Housing Corp v. Co-op College Residences (1975), 13 O.R. (2d) 384 (C.A.). 44

Winterhaven Stables v. Canada (1988), 53 D.L.R. (4th) 413 (Alta C.A.) 51

Shubenacadie Indian Band v. Canada (Human Rights Commission), [1998] 2 F.C. 198 (T.D.). 68

YMHA Jewish Community Centre v. Brown, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 1532. 72

Reference Re Canada Assistance Plan, [1991] 2 S.C.R. 525. 77

(b) Commentary

P. E. Trudeau, *Federal-Provincial Grants and the Spending Power of Parliament* (Ottawa: Queens Printer, 1969) at 4-34. 93

A. Petter, "Federalism and the Myth of the Federal Spending Power" (1989) 68 Can. Bar Rev. 448. 101

P. W. Hogg, Constitutional Law of Canada (Toronto: Carswell, 1999) at 159-163. 116

D. Coyne, "The Meech Lake Accord and the Spending Power Proposals: Fundamentally Flawed" in M. D. Behiels, ed., *The Meech Lake Primer: Conflicting Views of the 1987 Constitutional Accord* (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1989) at 245-267. 118

(c) Constitutional provisions and proposals

Constitution Act, 1982, s. 36 129

Meech Lake Accord of 1987, Schedule, s. 7 (to insert proposed s. 106A into the *Constitution Act, 1867*). 129

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, s. 16 (to insert proposed s. 106A into the *Constitution Act, 1867*) 129

2. Intergovernmental Agreements

(a) Cases

Reference Re Canada Assistance Plan (above)

Saskatchewan Egg Producers Marketing Board v. Ontario (Min. of Agriculture & Food), [1993] O.J. No. 434 (Gen. Div.) 130

Finlay v. Minister of Finance (Standing), [1986] 2 S.C.R. 607 137

Finlay v. Minister of Finance (Merits), [1993] 1 S.C.R. 1080. 147

Brown v. British Columbia (Attorney General) (1997), 41 B.C.L.R. (3d) 265 (S.C.). 168

Collett v. Ontario (A.G.) (1995), 124 D.L.R. (4th) 426 (Ont. Gen. Div.) 174

Lofstrom v. Murphy (1971), 22 D.L.R. (3d) 120 (Sask. C.A.). 182

Masse v. Ontario (Ministry of Community and Social Services) (1996), 134 D.L.R. (4th) 20 (Ont. Gen. Div.). 184

(b) Relevant constitutional provisions

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, s. 17 (to insert proposed s. 126A into the *Constitution Act, 1867*) 196

3. Impact of the *Charter*

Federated Anti-Poverty Groups of British Columbia v. British Columbia (Minister of Social Services), [1996] B.C.J. No. 2088 197

R. v. S.S., [1990] 2 S.C.R. 254. 202

Haig v. Canada (Chief Electoral Officer), [1993] 2 S.C.R. 995 208

E. Toward a New Social Union?

1. Constitutional Proposals

Ontario's Proposal for a Social Charter for Canada (February 13, 1992). 221

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, ss. 30 (to amend s. 36 of the *Constitution Act, 1982*), 31 (to insert a new s. 36.1, 36.2, 37, and 37.1 into the *Constitution Act, 1982*). 222

A Framework to Improve the Social Union for Canadians (February 4, 1999). 223

2. Commentary

T. J. Courchene, *ACCESS: A Convention on the Canadian Economic and Social Systems* (working paper prepared for the Ontario Ministry of Intergovernmental Affairs, 1996). 231

M. Biggs, *Building Blocks for Canada's New Social Union*, Canadian Policy Research Networks Working Paper No. F02, 39-43 (1996). 248

K. O'Hara with the assistance of S. Cox, *Securing the Social Union*, Canadian Policy Research Networks Study No. CPRN02, 53-67 (1998). 251

W. B.P. Robson & D. Schwanen, *Social Union Agreement: Too Flawed to Last* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, (1999). 261

III. ECONOMIC POLICY

A. Economic Union

1. The case for Economic Union

(a) The Value of Economic Union

J.R.S. Prichard with J. Benedickson, "Securing the Canadian Economic Union: Federalism and Internal Barriers to Trade" in M.J. Trebilcock et al., eds., *Federalism and the Canadian Economic Union* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983) 3 at 5-15. 1

Government of Canada, *Canadian Federalism and Economic Union: Partnership for Prosperity* (Ottawa: Minster of Supply and Services, 1991) at 2 and 9-14. 6

R. J. Howse, *Economic Union, Social Justice, and Constitutional Reform: Towards a High But Level Playing Field* (North York, ON: York University Centre for for Public Law and Public Policy, 1992) at 7-16. 12

D. Schneiderman, "Economic Citizenship and Deliberative Democracy: An Inquiry into Constitutional Limitations on Economic Regulation" (1993) 21 Queen's L.J. 125 at 125-130, 141-146 and 151-165. 18

K. Swinton, "Courting Out Way to Economic Integration: Judicial Review and the Canadian Economic Union" (1995) 25 Can Bus. L.J. 280 at 288-293. 32

(b) Positive vs. Negative Integration

Howse, *Economic Union, Social Justice, and Constitutional Reform: Towards a High But Level Playing Field* at 25-29. 35

M. J. Trebilcock & Rambood Behboodi, "The Canadian Agreement on Internal Trade: Retrospects and Prospects" in M.J. Trebilcock & D. Schwanen, eds., *Getting There: An Assessment of the Agreement on Internal Trade* (Toronto, C.D. Howe Institute, 1995) 20 at 33-39. 37

(c) Barriers to Economic Mobility: The Evidence and Examples

J. Walley, "The Impact of Federal Policies on Interprovincial Activity" in M.J. Trebilcock et al., eds., *Federalism and the Canadian Economic Union* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983) 201 at 217-22. 40

Michael J. Trebilcock et al., "Provincial Induced Barriers to Trade in Canada: A Survey", in M.J. Trebilcock et al., eds., *Federalism and the Canadian Economic Union* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983) 243 at 254-257, 274-279 and 291-294..... 43

2. The Constitution and Economic Policy

(a) Federal Jurisdiction

(i) Trade and Commerce

Interprovincial and International Trade

Dominion Stores vs. The Queen, [1980] 1 S.C.R. 844. 48

Labatt Breweries v. A.G. Canada, [1980] 1 S.C.R. 914..... 58

General Regulation of Trade Affecting the Whole Dominion

General Motors v. City National Leasing, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 641..... 70

(ii) Peace, Order and Good Government (POGG)

R. v. Crown Zellerbach Canada Ltd. 49 D.L.R. (4th) 161 83

(b) Provincial Jurisdiction: Property & Civil Rights

Carnation Co. v. Quebec Agricultural Marketing Board, [1968] S.C.R. 238. 96

A.G. Manitoba v. Manitoba Egg & Poultry Assoc., [1971] S.C.R. 689. 100

Central Canada Potash v. Government of Saskatchewan, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 42. 107

3. Interprovincial Mobility

(a) Constitutional Provisions

Constitution Act, 1867, s. 121..... 111

Constitution Act, 1982, 22. 6(2)-(4). 111

(b) Goods, Capital & Services

Gold Seal v. A.G. Alberta (1921), 62 S.C.R. 424..... 112

Atlantic Smoke Shops, [1943] A.C. 550. 115

Murphy v. CPR, [1958] S.C.R. 626..... 118

Re Agricultural Products Marketing Act, [1978] 2 S.C.R. 1198. 123

(c) Persons: Mobility Rights

Law Society of Upper Canada v. Skapinker, [1984] 1 S.C.R. 357..... 128

Black v. Law Society of Alberta, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 591. 134

Canadian Egg Marketing Board v. Richardson, [1998] 3 S.C.R. 157..... 149

Island Equine Clinic Ltd. v. Prince Edward Island (1991), 81 D.L.R. (4th) 350 (P.E.I.S.C.A.D)..... 176

McCarten v. Prince Edward Island, (1993) 101 D.L.R. (4th) 335 (P.E.I.S.C.T.D.). 178

Prince Edward Island v. Walker, (1993) 107 D.L.R. (4th) 69 (P.E.I.C.A.). 180

Waldman v. British Columbia (Medical Services Commission) (1997), 150 D.L.R. (4th) 405 (B.C.S.C.). 182

4. Towards the Canadian Economic Union

(a) Agreement on Internal Trade

D. Schwanen, "Canadian Regardless of Origin: 'Negative Integration' and the Agreement on Internal Trade" in H. Lazar, ed., *Non-Constitutional Renewal* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1998) 169..... 202

D. Cohen, "The Internal Trade Agreement: Furthering the Canadian Economic Disunion?" (1995) 25 Can. Bus. L.J. 280..... 219

R. J. Howse, "Between Anarchy and the Rule of Law: Dispute Settlement and Related Implementation Issues in the Agreement on Internal Trade" in M.J. Trebilcock & D. Schwanen, eds., *Getting There: An Assessment of the Agreement on Internal Trade* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1995) 170 at 171-186..... 231

Re Manganese-Based Fuel Additives Act, File No. 97/99 (June 12, 1998). 238

(b) Unilateral Federal Action pursuant to 91(2) and POGG

Hunt v. T & N, [1993] 4 S.C.R. 289..... 251

R.J. Howse, *Securing the Canadian Economic Union: Legal and Constitutional Options for the Federal Government* (C.D. Howe Institute, 1996) at 3-14. 261

(c) Reading 91(2) broadly: dormant commerce clause

K. Swinton, "Courting Out Way to Economic Integration: Judicial Review and the Canadian Economic Union" (1995) 25 Can. Bus. L.J. 280 at 295-302. 273

(d) Amending s. 121

A Renewed Canada -- The Report of the Special Joint Committee on a Renewed Canada (1992) (text & proposed amendment to amend s. 121 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*). 278

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, s. 31 (to insert a new s. 36.1 into the *Constitution Act, 1982*). 279

Howse, *Economic Union, Social Justice, and Constitutional Reform: Towards a High But Level Playing Field* at 34-45. 280

Trebilcock & Behboodi, "The Canadian Agreement on Internal Trade: Retrospects and Prospects" at 27-33 286

(e) Relationship with Social Union

Howse, *Economic Union, Social Justice, and Constitutional Reform: Towards a High But Level Playing Field* at 102-108, 119 and 128 290

David Schneiderman, "The Constitutional Politics of Poverty", in J. Bakan & D. Schneiderman, eds., *Social Justice and the Constitution* (Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1992) 125 at 131-134 294

B. International Trade and the Canadian Constitution

1. The *Labour Conventions* controversy

Reference Re Regulation and Control of Aeronautics in Canada, [1932] A.C. 54. 296

Reference re Regulation and Control of Radio Communication in Canada, [1932] A.C. 304 299

Reference re Weekly Rest in Industrial Undertakings Act, Minimum Wages Act and Limitations of Hours Work Act , [1937] A.C. 326. 302

R. J. Howse, "The *Labour Conventions* Doctrine in an Era of Global Interdependence: Rethinking the Constitutional Dimensions of Canada's External Relations" (1990) at 16 Can. Bus. L.J. 160 at 163-78. 307

2. Jurisdiction to Implement NAFTA

R. Howse, "NAFTA and the Constitution: Does *Labour Conventions* Really Matter Any More?" (1994) 5 Const. Forum 54, excerpts. 316

Anonymous, "Issues of Constitutional Jurisdiction" in Peter M. Leslie & Ronald L. Watts, eds., *Canada: The State of the Federation 1987-88* (Kingston: Queen's University Institute for Intergovernmental Affairs, 1989) 39 at 41-51. 318

R. Sullivan, "Jurisdiction to Negotiate and Implement Free Trade Agreements in Canada" (1987) 24 U.W.O. L. Rev. 63. 324

3. Impact upon Canadian Federalism

Anonymous, "Issues of Constitutional Jurisdiction", 51-55. 335

Howse, "NAFTA and the Constitution: Does *Labour Conventions* Really Matter Any More?" excerpts. 338

Howse, *Securing the Canadian Economic Union: Legal and Constitutional Options for the Federal Government* at 14-16. 341

Ian Robinson, "The NAFTA, the Side-Deals, and Canadian Federalism: Constitutional Reform by Other Means?" in R.L. Watts & D.M. Brown, eds., *Canada: The State of the Federation* (Kingston: Queen's University Institute for Intergovernmental Affairs, 1994) 193. 344

C. Regulatory Competition

Ron Daniels, "Should Provinces Compete? The Case for a Competitive Corporate Law Market" (1991) 36 McGill L.J. 130 at 130-151. 362

VOLUME II

IV. ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY

A. The Legal Framework

Crown Zellerbach, (above)

Friends of the Oldman River Society v. Canada (Minister of Transport), [1992] 1 S.C.R. 3. 1

R. v. Hydro Quebec, [1997] 3 S.C.R. 213. 9

B. Harmonization

1. Documents

A Canada-Wide Accord on Environmental Harmonization (Jan. 28, 1998). 30

Canada-Wide Inspections Sub-Agreement (Jan. 28, 1998). 33

Sub-Agreement On Environmental Assessment (Jan. 28, 1998). 36

Canada-Wide Environmental Standards Sub-Agreement (Jan. 28, 1998) 41

2. Case-law

Canadian Environmental Law Assn. v. Canada (Minister of the Environment), [1999] F.C.J. No. 588. 46

3. Commentary

Patrick Fafard, "Green Harmonization: The Success and Failure of Recent Environmental Intergovernmental Relations" in Harvey Lazar, ed., *Non-Constitutional Renewal* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1998) 203. 58

C. The International Dimension

1. Documents

Canadian Intergovernmental Agreement Regarding the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation. 71

2. Cases

Filing of a Submission under Articles 14 and 15 of the *North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation*, concerning pollution from agricultural sources in Quebec, SEM-97-003. 80

Re Manganese-Based Fuel Additives Act, (above)

3. Commentary

M. I. Jeffery, "The Legal Framework for Environmental Regulation Under the North American Free Trade Agreement" in S.J. Rubin & D.C. Alexander, eds., *NAFTA and the Environment* (The Hague: Kluwer Law International, 1996) 207 at 207-224 96

S. Richardson & A. Beaulieu, "The North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation: A Canadian Perspective", in *ibid.*, 229. 106

J. A. Soloway, "Environmental Trade Barriers Under NAFTA: The MMT Fuel Additives Controversy" (1999) 8 Minn. J. Global Trade 55. 124

V. ABORIGINAL PEOPLES

A. The Legal Framework

Calder v. Attorney General of British Columbia (1973). 34 D.L.R.(3d) 145 1

Guerin v. The Queen, [1984] 2 S.C.R. 335 10

R. v. Van der Peet, [1996] 2 S.C.R. 507 19

R v. Gladstone, [1996] 2 S.C.R. 723. 29

R v. Delgamuukw, [1997] 3 S.C.R. 1010 40

R. v. Pamajewon, [1996] 2 S.C.R. 821 61

B. Land Claims: British Columbia

C. McKee, "The British Columbia Treaty-Making Process: Entering a New Phase in Aboriginal-State Relations" in P.C. Fafard & D.M. Brown, eds., *Canada: The State of the Federation 1996* (Kingston: Queen's University Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1997) 213. 65

C. Self-Government and the Constitution

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, *Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples*, vol. 2 (Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services Canada, 1996) at 213-225 and 245-279. 83

P. W. Hogg & M. E. Turpel, "Implementing Aboriginal Self-Government: Constitutional and Jurisdictional Issues" (1995) 74 Can. Bar Rev. 187. 108

VI. AMENDMENT

A. Pre-1982

P. W. Hogg, "Constitutional Law - Amendment of the *British North America Act* - Role of the Provinces" (1982) 60 Can. Bar Rev. 307 at 307-328. 1

B. The 1982 Amending Formula

1. Constitutional Provisions

Constitution Act, 1982, Part V. 12

2. Case-Law

Campbell v. Canada (1988), 49 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (B.C.C.A.). 14

Hogan v. Newfoundland (Attorney-General), [1999] N.J. No. 5 (Nfld. S.C.T.D.). 22

2. Commentary

P. Macklem & B. Ryder, "National Interest, National Action: Ottawa Has Power to Initiate Bilateral Process with Quebec" *The Toronto Star* (10 November 1995). 30

K. Swinton, "Amending the Canadian Constitution: Lessons from Meech Lake" (1992) 42 U.T.L.J. 139. 33

A. C. Cairns, "Citizens (Outsiders) and Governments (Insiders) in Constitution-Making: The Case of Meech Lake" (1988) 4 Can. Pub. Pol. S121. 49

3. What is the "Constitution of Canada"?

Constitution Act, 1982, s. 52(2). 62

New Brunswick Broadcasting Co. v. Nova Scotia (Speaker of the House of Assembly), [1993] 1 S.C.R. 319. 63

C. Recent Initiatives and Constitutional Proposals

An Act Respecting Constitutional Amendments, S.C. 1996, c. 1 [*Regional Veto Act*] 67

Constitutional Amendment Approval Act, S.B.C. 1991, c. 2, s. 3(1). 67

Meech Lake Accord of 1987, Schedule, ss. 9-12 (to amend ss. 40, 41, 44, 46 and 47 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*). 68

VII. SECESSION

1. Case-Law and Commentary

Reference re Secession of Quebec, [1998] 2 S.C.R. 217. 1

A. Orkin & J. Birenbaum, "The Aboriginal Argument: The Requirement of Aboriginal Consent" in D. Schneiderman, ed., *The Quebec Decision: Perspectives on the Supreme Court Ruling on Secession* (Toronto: James Lortimer, 1999) 83. 20

2. General

P. J. Monahan, *Cooler Heads Shall Prevail* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1995). 25

R. Simeon, *Limits to Partnership: Canada-Quebec Relations in a Postsecession Era* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1998). 60

P. J. Monahan & M. J. Bryant (with Nancy Coté), *Coming to Terms with Plan B* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1996) at 17-37. 95

P. Russell & B. Ryder, *Ratifying a Postreferendum agreement on Quebec Sovereignty* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1997) 116

3. Specific Topics

(a) Citizenship

S. A. Williams, *International Legal Effects of Secession by Quebec* (North York, ON: York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy, 1992) at 23-29 145

S. H. Hartt, *Divided Loyalties: Dual Citizenship and Reconstituting the Economic Union* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1995). 149

(b) Debt

P. Boothe & R. Harris, "Alternative Divisions of Federal Assets and Liabilities" in Robin Boadway et al., eds., *Economic Dimensions of Constitutional Change*, vol. 1 (Kingston, ON: John Deutsch Institute for the Study of Economic Policy, 1991) 453 at 453-467 and 470-473 164

(c) Economic Association

P. Monahan & L. Covello, *An Agenda for Constitutional Reform* (North York, ON: York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy, 1992) at 105-112 173

R. A. Young, *The Secession of Quebec and the Future of Canada*, 2d ed. (Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's Press, 1998) at 29-40 and 60-74. 176

(d) Common Currency

Young, *The Secession of Quebec and the Future of Canada* at 41-47 191

(e) Aboriginal Peoples

K. McNeil, "Aboriginal Nations and Québec's Boundaries: Canada Couldn't Give What It Didn't Have" in D. Drache & R. Perin, *Negotiating with a Sovereign Quebec* (Toronto: James Lortimer, 1992) 107. 195

4. The Rest of Canada

A. C. Cairns, *Looking into the Abyss: The Need for a Plan C* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1997). 209

A. C. Cairns, "Constitutional Change and the Three Equalities" in R. L. Watts & D. M. Brown, eds., *Options for a New Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991) 77. 241

R. Howse, "Searching for Plan A: National Unity and the Chretien Government's New Federalism", in H. Lazar, ed., *Non-Constitutional Renewal* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1998) 311 254